

Message

From: Rieth, Susan [Rieth.Susan@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/1/2013 9:34:01 PM
To: Subramaniam, Ravi [Subramaniam.Ravi@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: presentation of rat tumor data example at ARA

Well said. Glad you stood up to Tom. Thanks for forwarding Sue

From: Subramaniam, Ravi
Sent: Saturday, June 01, 2013 11:30:21 AM
To: Rieth, Susan
Subject: FW: presentation of rat tumor data example at ARA

FYI.

From: Subramaniam, Ravi
Sent: Saturday, June 01, 2013 11:22 AM
To: Tom Starr
Cc: Bussard, David; Subramaniam, Ravi
Subject: presentation of rat tumor data example at ARA

Dear Tom:

This is with reference to your presentation at the ARA workshop.

In the workshop, an analysis of the rat tumor data was presented and attributed to EPA. I assume your reference was to the counter-example I provided you in our email exchange to illustrate that the bottom up approach underestimates the slope of a fit to the rat tumor data. However, what I sent you was very different even at a conceptual level from what was presented at the workshop. As I understand it, the bottom up approach is based on adduct levels as the dose metric, so the counter-example I had shared with you was similarly based on adduct levels as the dose-metric, not exposure concentration in ppm.

I realize that communications between us are not confidential, but I also note that when sharing the counter example with you I had not understood that you were going to present it, even if done so accurately, in a conference. That does raise the hurdle to freely sharing ideas in dialogue. I had used mean adduct levels for the dose-metric since the purpose was illustrative; for any formal presentation, I would have used or made reference to conceptually similar results with lower bounds.

If I am correct that your reference was to what I had shared with you, I hope you will correct them before further distribution by the ARA. If you continue to make reference to EPA materials, at a minimum I ask that you accurately characterize what was sent to you. I will be glad to discuss further if any of this is not clear.

Best Regards,
Ravi.